

DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

Office of the Director
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-7795
(614) 645-6675 (FAX)

Tuesday, December 20, 2016
77 N. Front Street, STAT Room (Lower Level)

17:20

Planning Division
50 W. Gay St.
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8664

Downtown Commission
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)
Urban Design Manager
(614) 645-8404
djthomas@columbus.gov

I. Attendance

Present: Otto Beatty, Jr.; (Acting Chair); Michael Brown; Tedd Hardesty; Kyle Katz;
Robert Loversidge; Mike Lusk; Jana Maniace; Danni Palmore

Absent: Steve Wittmann

City Staff: Daniel Thomas; Steve Schoeny; Kevin Wheeler; Andy Beard; Anthony
Celebreze, Jr.; Brandan Hayes

II. Approval of the November 15, 2016 Downtown Commission Meeting Results

Motion to approve KK, (8-0)

III. Certificate of Appropriateness – Alterations, Previously Approved Projects

Case #1 16-12-1

18:00

Address: 160 S. High Street

Columbus Commons

Applicant and Design Professional: Karen McCoy, MKSK

Property Owner: Capitol South Community Urban Redevelopment Corporation
(CSCURC)

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for “Bosque” area of Columbus Commons
CC3359.05(C)1, 3359.17(C)6, including:

- New drainage to relieve pooling
- Expanded planting beds and new planting
- Harder surface for seating and tables

Discussion

Guy Worley – Commons has been in operation for six years and has been well used.
During that time wear has taken place and there is a need to make improvements. KK
– motion to approve, these are obviously good improvements.

Results

Motion to approve (7-1-0) Hardesty recusing

Case #2 16-12-2

21:15

Address: 261 S. Front Street**Matan Project****Applicant & Property Owner:** 261 Front, Ltd. (Lifestyle Communities)**Architect:** Niles Bolton Associates (Atlanta)**Request:**

Certificate of Appropriateness for addition to previously approved project (Matan Project)

Discussion

Andrew Wappner (Lifestyle) – Has gained ownership of the SW corner of the block. Decided to incorporate the development of the entire site. Garage has also been reconfigured. Some units have been added in the new extension as well as having a small parking garage. New elevations shown. KK – questions about materials of the new garage portion (brick and architectural mesh – same mesh is on Front St.). Mesh is used on other garage. Concerns were expressed about how Main St. is a primary St. with the need of exposed parking to be aesthetically handled. JM – could a horizontal element be added to break up the opening? A - could add horizontal element, mesh is necessary for ventilation. Glazing was investigated. JM – possibly come back or show design solution to staff. KK - A few of us can get together with staff to review. Jana – I agree. KK – move to accept all but the details of the screening adjacent to Main Street. Submit sample to small group.

Results

Motion to approve with the exception of presenting sample of parking screening design and samples to small group (Katz, Maniace) (6-1-0) . Hardesty abstaining

Case #3 16-12-3

32:30

Address: 255 S. High Street**Applicant:** Crawford Hoying Development Partners, Nelson Yoder**Property Owner:** Swan Super Cleaners**Design Professionals :** DesignGroup, Michael Bongiorno and Liz Maso**Request:**

Reduction of overall height of previously Commission approved mixed use (apartment / retail / structured parking) building. CC3359.05(C)1)

Discussion

Liz Mazo – was approved in October. Pre-construction review revealed that code would necessitate certain requirements which could be mitigated with an 8 ft. reduction in height. Lobbies would have to be closed off. Approved rendering and proposed rendering shown.

Results

Motion to approve (7-1-0) Lusk abstaining

Case #4 16-12-4

36:40

Address: 77 East Nationwide Blvd.**Applicant:** Indus Hotels

David Kozar

Property Owner: 77 Hotel Partners LLC**Attorney:** Jeffrey Brown**Design Professional :** Braun & Steidl Architects, Craig VanderVeen

Request:

Alterations (Certificate of Appropriateness) of previously approved project (Hilton Canopy Hotel), including CC3359.05(C):

- Elimination of EIFS and replacement with brick
- Change of window detailing
- Changes in front lower level elevation – more glass on left, relocation of entry canopy

Discussion

Canopy Hilton was approved last year and is being brought back by developer at the request of hotel. Prior approval was shown along with revisions. Room sizes on the have been increased slightly. The canopy has been shifted one bay to the east and the other bays, with the exception of the drive through, have been glazed with the addition of a pane pattern. KK – move to accept, DP, 2nd.

Results

Motion to approve (8-0)

IV. Certificate of Appropriateness – Final, New**Case #5 16-12-5**

43:00

Address: 89 E. Nationwide Blvd.

Applicant and Design Professional: FRCH Design Worldwide (Cincinnati); Douglas Richards, AIA

Property Owner: Philip J. Fulton, Trustee of Philip J. Fulton Recoverable Trust

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for addition, patio, canopy and signage. CC3359.05(C)1)

The project was conceptually reviewed by the Commission last month, see Results.

Discussion

Construction as well as graphics have been submitted. Description was given. There will be a canopy across the front of the building. Materials brought. Questions were brought up about ADA accessibility and valet parking. Drop off places are being sought in front of the site which will mean the loss of a two parallel parking spaces from the City. ADA access is being coordinated with the adjacent Canopy Hotel. Landscaping will be kept the same. The rear of the property will remain unaltered. The sign post will be moved back. RL – move for approval.

Results

Motion to approve. (8-0)

Case #6 16-12-6

54:20

ParksEdge Condominiums, Phase Two

Applicant: Nationwide Realty Investors, LLC (NRI)

Property Owner: Parks Edge Place LLC (NRI)

Design Professional : Columbus Architectural Studio, Daniel Hanes

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for a new 12 story condominium

Discussion

Fly through perspective was shown. Materials will match those of Phase One (West Building). The new building will be similar but the east corner will have more glass. The majority of the cooling mechanicals are on the roof of Phase One. KK – move to accept, RL – 2nd. The remaining parcel facing McFerson Commons will be designed later in response to sales and other factors.

Results

Motion to approve (8-0)

V. Conceptual Review

Case #7 16-12-7

59:00

Address: 290 East Town Street

Applicant and Design Professional: Jennifer Carney (Carney Ranker Architects)

Property Owner: OhioHealth Corp.

Request:

Conceptual review for improvements to the first floor of a mixed use commercial (first floor) / parking garage (five levels) building, including: CC3359.05(C)1)

- Undulating canopy with supports
- Turret at the corner of Town and Sixth similar to motif used elsewhere near site by OhioHealth
- New storefront – windows and brick cladding
- Patio
- Landscaping – brick walk and planters
- OhioHealth signage at corner

Discussion

The first floor is office space with the remaining 5 stories parking. Description of proposal. New rendering was distributed to further describe the project. Initial thoughts were to extend sidewalk improvements into the R.O.W., but this is no longer the case. Some of the arches on the first floor will be encased by brick. All of the windows will be replaced and framed with dark bronze metal. The windows will be tinted a little. KK – advocate more first floor transparency. OB – pointed out that this will be an office with some expectation for privacy. A – It will be a family practice. Final window decision has not been made. Some outside seating, basically for employees, will be provided. TH – thought that the planters (even if on private property) could be stronger and asked applicant if she had seen the Downtown Streetscape Standards. RL – this is really a harsh part of streetscape in downtown and this is a good attempt. A – the signage “Urgent Care” was more of a place holder and will be more descriptive of actual function. RL –advocated that the signage might come back a little smaller.

Results

Motion to approve

VI. Certificate of Appropriateness – Signage

Case #8 16-12-8

1:09:20

Address: 111 North Fourth St.

Applicant: Earl Staffan, exp US Services Inc.

Property Owner: Denson Parker, AT&T Corporate Real Estate

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for new skyline graphics. CC3359.05(C)1)

Discussion

In 2012 AT&T proposed and erected three signs on the roof of their 12 story switch space building. They are changing their logo and would like to move the signs down. The letters AT&T will be removed as well as the support structure taken off. KK – move to accept.

Results

Motion to approve. (8-0)

Case #9 16-12-9

1:13:30

Address: 146 South High Street / HighPoint / Swan Cleaners

Applicant: SignCom

Property Owner: Falco Smith & Kelley Ltd.

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of signage for relocating retail. CC3359.05(C)1)

Discussion

Swan Cleaners will be relocating from 255 S. High Street to this location at HighPoint. There will be a wall sign and a blade sign. There was some thought of using the existing sign at 255, but these will be new. The raceway will be painted to match the color of the stonework. RL – suggested that the raceway might be continuous. Others thought otherwise. KK – move to accept.

Results

Motion to approve. (8-0)

VII. Certificate of Appropriateness – Land Use Approval**Case #10 16-12-10LU**

1:17:28

Address: 237 Cleveland Ave.

Applicant: Brian Zingelmann, Architect

Property Owner: Tarik Hamed, Katz Tires

Request:

Land use approval for automotive use (tire sales and service) of former (now vacant) commercial building. CC3359.05(C)1) 3359.17

Chapter 3359.17 (Downtown District in the Zoning Code) – requires certain uses permitted only by certificate of appropriateness, including Automobile repair shop or installation facility. The proposed tire sales and service use above qualifies for such use. As customary, property owners within 125 feet of the site have been notified of the proposal.

Discussion

Architectural presentation is waiting for land use decision. Adjacent property owners within 125 feet have been notified. Columbus State Community College (CSCC) borders the property on three sides and has written a letter in opposition to the use and has written a letter, which has been distributed. Brian Zingelmann, architect for Katz. KK – CSCC long term investment in the area. Within the next couple of months CSCC will be proceeding with new plans on the east side of Cleveland. The property is flag shaped, with the Volpes – Auto body specialists) owning the grass / gravel parcel immediately to the south. TH – knowing all of the recent work and anticipated higher density, in terms of highest and best use, this doesn't fit. Doesn't object to having this use somewhere in downtown, but not at this specific location. Staff referred to current Katz site on E Main St. Discovery District did a development plan in 2013 which indicated the likelihood of significant changes in SE downtown due to the new interstate off-ramps and expansion of hospitals. The store on E. Main would be closed. KK – Cleveland Ave. corridor has tremendous potential that has not yet been realized. Main axis thru Discovery District, we need to protect it. There is a place for service industries, maybe immediately outside of downtown. DP – there will also be COTA BRT improvements. OB – would be hard to make a decision without knowing what else is going on around in the area. KK - The proposal is a restricted use which we have to approve at this corner. JM – not a good idea to put there. Proximity to bookstore and other academic buildings. ML - Somewhere in the downtown area this might be appropriate. RL – we have a number of tire shops downtown, not a bad thing, just a matter of where it goes. KK – move to accept use. DP – 2nd.

Results

Motion to approve. (0-8) Motion fails.

VIII. Certificate of Appropriateness for Student Project

Case #11 16-12-11

1:30:30

Address: 91 Cleveland Ave. Columbus College of Art and Design

Applicant: Tobias Katz

Property Owner: Columbus College of Art and Design

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a “Tiny House”. CC3359.05(C)1)

Discussion

Staff described project. A temporary student project that will be removed from downtown a by the summer. KK – fun project. Move to accept. RL – 2nd.

Results

Motion to approve.

IX. Requests for Certificate of Appropriateness for Advertising Murals

Case #12 16-12-12M

1:29:00

YMCA Ad Mural

66 S. Third Street

Applicant: Orange Barrel Media

Property Owner: Capitol Square Ltd.

Design Professional: Orange Barrel Media

Request:

Design review and approval for installation of vinyl mesh advertising murals to be located on the north elevation at 66 S. Third St. Proposed mural – The YMCA “This is your time”. The Downtown Commission has previously approved numerous murals at this location, the current one being for Bud Light. CC3359.07(D)

Dimensions of mural: 29’W x 26’H Two dimensional, lit

Term of installation: Seeking approval from January 2 through March 31, 2017

Area of mural: 754 sf

Approximate % of area that is text: 3.3%

Discussion

Strong colors, non-profit, small amount of text. KK – motion to accept.

Results

Motion to approve (8-0)

XI. Business / Discussion**Ad Mural Review Process**

1:31:24

Public Forum

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last notification (November 11, 2016)

1. 144 E. State St. – in kind windows and door - Meleca Architects
2. 144 E. State St – rooftop patio for private residence (Meleca)
3. 145 E. Rich St. – projecting sign on S. Fourth St.
4. 50 W. Broad St. – LeVeque signage (prior approval from HRC)
5. 225 S. Third St. – Lot split – Two25 Commons project
6. 360 S. Third St. – United Way banner
7. 200 W. Nationwide Blvd. – Arena temporary security bollards – to be followed up with permanent streetscape design (NRI) to be reviewed by Commission

Note: Next meeting will be on January 24, 2017, the fourth Tuesday of the month (five weeks away).

If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 645-8404.

2:17:23